



General Assembly's overall review of the implementation of WSIS outcomes

Official Form for Written Submissions

A. Your Information

Title: [Click here to enter text.](#)

First name: [Click here to enter text.](#) **Last name:** [Click here to enter text.](#)

Name of Organization: [Click here to enter text.](#) **Stakeholder Type¹:** [Click here to enter text.](#)

Country: [Members States of the Group of 77 and China](#) **Email:** secretariat@g77.org

B. Formal Input

Some guiding questions for your submissions are listed below:

1. To what extent has progress been made on the vision of the people-centred, inclusive and development-oriented Information Society in the ten years since the WSIS?

The World Summit on the Information Society has declared our common desire and commitment to build a people-centred, inclusive and development-oriented information society, where everyone can create, access, utilize and share information and knowledge, and individuals, communities and all peoples are enabled to achieve their full potentials in promoting sustainable development and improving quality of life. Over the past ten years, the international community has achieved good progress in promoting such a global endeavor, and in narrowing the digital divide, thanks to joint efforts of all concerned, and in particular, to the rapid ICT development in developing countries.

Information and communication technologies, especially the Internet, have brought about a tremendous impact on the economy, education, culture, healthcare, politics and access to information, with great benefits to the lives of individuals and societies.

¹ When specifying your stakeholder type, please indicate one of the following: Government, Civil Society, Private Sector, Academia, and Technical Sector.

While recognizing how much we have achieved so far, we still face the challenges of bringing the benefits of the Information Society to over half the world population and increasing security of communications.

We must therefore acknowledge that substantial progress has been made in the pursuit of the objectives set forth in the World Summit on the Information Society, but also highlight that many challenges are still to be overcome, in particular as they relate to the development of knowledge societies and ICT services and infrastructure in developing countries.

2. What are the challenges to the implementation of WSIS outcomes?

The review process provides an opportunity to evaluate the implementation of the WSIS outcomes, and seek consensus through discussions on the challenges ahead and major issues to be addressed. Such a process is essential to clarifying the prospects for the information society and the way forward, and to promoting cooperation and common development of all countries. Progress has been uneven and serious challenges remain in the implementation of WSIS outcomes.

A key part of taking stock of the progress made and addressing gaps and areas for continued focus involves looking critically at the Action Lines developed in the first two phases of the WSIS Process, and analyze the progress made.

The Outcome Document must focus on the **unresolved issues under Action Line C1**, and incorporate the following recommendations by UN DESA on this Action Line:

- **Allocate adequate resources for ICT projects**, ensuring proper competencies of the personnel involved in the delivery of the projects,
- Prioritize strong project management and coordination skills as well as technical knowledge, and
- Address access and affordability issues of citizens in developing countries.

The Outcome Document must focus on the **unresolved issues under Action Line C2**, and incorporate the following recommendations by the ITU on this Action Line:

- Enhance the coverage, quality, and affordability of broadband networks,
- Develop a well-planned, well-maintained, economic and efficient broadband backbone to ensure the delivery of Internet services,
- Utilize policy and financing mechanisms such as Universal Service Funds and Public Private Partnerships, to connect and cover rural and remote areas with affordable ICT infrastructure, and
- Develop affordable equipment and services with economy of scale, conformity and interoperability with international standards.

The Outcome Document must focus on the **unresolved issues under Action Line C4**, and incorporate the following recommendations by the ITU on this Action Line:

- Establish more partnerships among different types of stakeholders in development of domestic policies and national programmes on capacity building in accordance with national policies and priorities.

- Enhance the affordability and accessibility of mobile devices and services in order for everyone to have an access to knowledge, lifelong learning and skills development.
- Increase research and analysis in capacity building in order to assist all stakeholders in development of their capacity, national programmes and policies
- Continue to provide training to local experts for the local communities to be more empowered and benefit from the local resources.
- Enhance the development of local content to facilitate the dissemination of ICT knowledge and skills.

The Outcome Document must focus on the unresolved issues under Action Line C5, and incorporate the following recommendations by the ITU on this Action Line:

- Continue to strengthen international cooperation mechanisms, including through discussion forums and information sharing and Public-private partnerships
- Foster the development of national capabilities by nation states, such as the assessments for national CIRTs/CERTs/CSIRTs and the elaboration of national cyber security strategies.
- Enable better understanding of cyber security demands and requirements by working on indices and metrics for measuring cyber security development and implementation levels.
- Underpin cooperation and support efforts for the elaboration of cyber security standards and other technical specifications
- Support cyber security development as applied to different sectors and technologies such as critical infrastructure, mobile, cloud services, etc.
- Understand and further cooperate for the protection of vulnerable groups: children, newly connected people, etc.

The Outcome Document must focus on the unresolved issues under Action Line C11, and incorporate the following recommendations by UN DESA on this Action Line:

- Encourage development aid in ICTs particularly for developing countries,
- Encourage greater input of developing countries on the deployment of funds for enhanced ownership and accountability
- Enhance data collection and dissemination related to the core list of ICT indicators at both the national and international levels, based on international standards and definitions.
- Include ICT statistics in national strategies for the development of statistics and in regional statistical work programmes.
- Strengthen local statistical capacity by assessing capacity needs and delivering targeted training on ICT statistics.

The review should reaffirm that In building the Information Society, States are strongly urged to take steps with a view to the avoidance of, and refrain from, any unilateral measure not in accordance with international law and the Charter of the United Nations that impedes the full achievement of economic and social development by the population of the affected countries, and that hinders the well-being of their population

3. What should be the priorities in seeking to achieve WSIS outcomes and progress towards the Information Society, taking into account emerging trends?

Expansion of affordable, reliable and secure broadband Internet access to all: In order to allow ICTs, particularly the Internet, to serve as should a tool to promote sustainable and inclusive

development, in full respect for human rights, it is necessary to develop mechanisms that will facilitate investment in internet infrastructure and human resources. This includes capacity building in the management and governance of the internet, as well as mechanisms to ensure that its operational costs become more evenly distributed among those who connected earlier and those who have come online later.

Bridging the digital divide: The Tunis Agenda had recognized that there was and continues to be a digital divide between the developing and developed world. The international community should strive to bridge the digital divide by promoting universal access to information and communication technologies, so as to create digital opportunities shared by all and ensure equal opportunities for all countries to pursue development powered by ICT innovations. The key to this effort is to give priority to satisfying the needs of developing countries, helping them strengthen communication infrastructure and capacity-building, improving their overall digital landscape, and promoting social-economic development through science and technology. The international community should foster a fairer and more reasonable international development order, and take strong actions to improve the ability of women, the youth and children to use information and Internet platforms.

While we acknowledge that considerable progress has been made in bridging the digital divide, there is still much work to be done. The Group recognizes that a vast majority of people that remain as yet unconnected, including people with disabilities, to the Internet reside in developing countries, and underscore the importance of bridging this divide.

The Outcome Document should emphasize the need for ensuring affordability of ICTs and the need for increased ICT penetration in all developing countries.

The Document must also recognize divides within countries themselves, and outline steps to bridge those divides as well.

The Document should also take steps to bridge the widening divide in broadband connectivity and access between developed and the majority of developing countries.

The Document must also create provisions for the development of local language content to ensure overall socio-economic development, since developing countries are often unable to access online content in their own language.

The document should set a goal for affordable “Internet for All” to be achieved by 2025. This goal should task the multi-stakeholder community to provide equal, affordable, and good quality access to all citizens of the world within the next ten years with the objective of establishing free of cost WiFi access, without any differentiation covering all developing countries of the world.

Since access would be meaningless without enabling devices to make use of the “Internet for All” goal, the review will also set a goal for multi-stakeholders to provide enabling low-cost devices with wireless connectivity for all citizens below poverty line in developing countries. A new Action Line, with an annual reporting mechanism should be created to monitor the yearly progress on this goal.

Lack of access to affordable and reliable technologies continues to remain the key challenge to ICT deployment among SIDS. Efforts need to be made for capacity building to enable access,

especially in social sectors like health and education. Samoa Pathway supports this in paragraph 27(g), by promoting “the use of information and communications technologies for, inter alia, education, the creation of employment, in particular youth employment, and economic sustainability purposes in Small Island developing States”.

Lack of access to information is coupled by non-interpretability of the data received. The digital divide continues to widen because access to information, in and of itself, does not result into knowledge. The digital divide can only be bridged when content and technology is geared towards local needs and priorities while enhancing capabilities of end users to make productive use of the data.

Gender Digital Divide: Within the widening gap of the digital divide, another critically important issue of a growing gender digital divide is becoming acute. Women are disproportionately left further and further behind on issues of ICT connectivity and access. A report released at the first International Forum on Women, ICT, and Development convened by the United States State Department in 2012 outlined that women were 23% less likely to use the Internet in low-to-medium income countries, and in sub-Saharan Africa, this gap soars to 43%. Therefore the following is proposed to be recognized during the review process:

The Outcome Document must recognize this divide, and mainstream gender issues into all of the WSIS Action Lines.

The review should also create a new dedicated Action Line towards bridging the gender digital divide.

The Outcome Document should also set a sub goal within the “Internet for All” objective focusing on “Doubling Internet Access for Women” which should task the multi-stakeholder community to double the number of women with online access within the next three years. The goal will also create training initiatives to ensure that women know how to use the technologies provided to them, and how to access content that is relevant to them, and that it is in their language. The multistakeholder should also especially include women in the “Internet for All” goal highlighted above.

The Outcome Document should direct the multistakeholder community to report annually on the progress achieved on bridging the gender digital divide.

Promoting development: The Group recognizes that this review process overlaps with the intergovernmental process on the transition from the Millennium Development Goals to the Sustainable Development Goals. We also recognize that the Tunis phase of WSIS was linked to the MDGs, and underscore the importance of linking this review process with the SDGs.

The international community should promote inter-connectivity by strengthening information and communication infrastructure, promote global sharing of advanced information and communication technologies and cooperation in this respect, and to advancing innovations and better integration of information and communication technologies with other drivers for sustainable development. The vision of ICT development should contribute to the implementation of the post-2015 development agenda, and support the advancement of the outcomes of WSIS review process in the context of the post-2015 development agenda.

The priorities of the Review must act upon the synergies between the SDGs and the work on ICTs for development, and ensure that the outcome document falls within the larger context of the post-2015 development agenda.

The ITU Document titled “WSIS-SDG Matrix: Linking WSIS Action Lines with Sustainable Development Goals” is particularly significant as it highlights the obvious synergies between the WSIS Action Lines and the Sustainable Development Goals. Key among these are the relationships between:

- Goal 4 and WSIS Action Lines C3, C4, C5, C6, C7 E-learning, C7 employment, C7 E-agriculture, C7 E-science, C8, and C10.
- Goal 5 and WSIS Action Line C1, C3, C4, C5, C6, C7 E-business, C7 E-health, C7 E-agriculture, C9, and C10
- Goal 8 and WSIS Action Lines C2, C3, C5, C6, C7 E-business, C7 E-employment, C7 E-environment, C7 E-agriculture, C8, and C10.
- Goal 9 and WSIS Action Lines C2, C3, C5, C6, C7 E-government, C7 E-business, C7 E-environment, C7 E-agriculture, C9, and C10
- Goal 17 and WSIS Action Lines C1, C3, C4, C5, C6, C7 E-government, C7 E-business, C7 E-health, C7 E-employment, C7, E-agriculture, C7 E-science, C10, and C11.

ICTs also play a critical role in climate change and disaster risk management. WSIS should look into leveraging technological capabilities in order to monitor, predict, mitigate and adapt to the adverse effects of climate change. These can be achieved through developing “ICT networks, early warning systems, remote sensing, computer based systems for mapping and wireless technologies” as mentioned in the Mauritius Strategy of Implementation, paragraph 11(i).

The creation of regional hubs to facilitate exchange of experiences and capacities in order to advance knowledge sharing should be supported. Regional access to information on best practices, policy mechanisms and programs for disaster risk reduction can be crucial to effectively and easily respond to natural disasters and environmental hazards.

The outcome document should also begin to breakdown ICT competency and use into different levels, in order to more effectively address the digital and gender divides. For instance, "connectivity" by itself is an overly simplified goal, as it does not recognize the quality of phone or internet connection. Similarly, ICT competency could range from using a smartphone to developing software for it. By defining different tiers of competency and use, the international community can then set targets and design interventions to move larger shares of the population from lower to higher tiers.

The above needs to be recognized and reinforced during the review process.

Internet governance: Improving internet governance should entail establishing a multilateral, democratic, and transparent international Internet governance system that ensures participation of all Governments, reasonable allocation of Internet resources, and joint management of key Internet infrastructure. The evolution of internet governance must progress in full observance of

two core principles enshrined in the Tunis Agenda: (i) the multistakeholder approach, in recognition that Internet governance requires the full involvement of governments, the private sector, civil society and international organizations; and (ii) the notion that those different stakeholders have different roles and responsibilities. The management of the internet involves both technical and public policy issues and that overall authority for internet related public policy issues is the sovereign right of States. Only by considering those two principles simultaneously will it be possible to address the many different issues involved in internet governance ranging from critical resources and infrastructure to combat against cybercrime in a variety of different organizations, fora, processes, etc. generally referred to as the Internet governance “ecosystem”.

This multistakeholder model should not be lopsided, and any tendency to place sole emphasis on the role of businesses and non-governmental organizations while marginalizing governments should be avoided. The roles and responsibilities of national governments with regard to regulation and security of the network should be upheld. It is necessary to ensure that the United Nations plays a facilitating role in setting up international public policies pertaining to the Internet. States should encourage the work on the internationalization of Internet Corporation for Assigned Names and Numbers (ICANN).

The G77 and China recognizes the progress that has been made on paragraphs 29-82 of the Tunis Agenda regarding Internet Governance. However, the G77 and China also believes that this review process is an important opportunity to critically consider and analyze the future role of the Internet Governance Forum (IGF), especially the work and the governing structure of the IGF before giving an extension to its mandate.

The Outcome Document should address the need for a clearer set of terms of reference for the governing structure, working methods, and mandate of the IGF so that the IGF can be more effective in facilitating the use of ICTs for development, and respond to the challenges facing developing countries.

The Outcome Document should also create a reporting mechanism to track the progress made by stakeholders towards the WSIS Vision of using ICTs for Development, and publish these findings so as to create transparency and accountability within the IGF.

The Document should also address the problems of the lack of inclusiveness of developing countries and stakeholders from developing countries, including the provision of financing mechanisms to ensure the participation of governments and stakeholders from developing countries, and outline steps to ensure more substantive outcomes which have been lacking in IGF proceedings.

Cyber security: It is crucial for all countries to work together through dialogue to keep the Internet safe and secure, on the basis of mutual respect, equality and mutual benefit, and jointly build a peaceful, secure, open and cooperative cyberspace. The international community should reach consensus as expeditiously as possible on a set of international rules governing the cyberspace. Cyber terrorism and crimes have become common threats to all countries, and should be dealt with through a joint international response. The international community should take robust measures to prevent terrorist organizations from using the Internet to broadcast terrorist and violent audio-visual materials, spread violent and extremist ideology, recruit new members, raise funds, and instigate, plot and execute terrorist activities.

These activities pose grave threats, both to developed and developing countries. The Outcome Document must proscribe the use of the Internet for activities that are illegal, unlawful, and detrimental to the global law and order. Any pictures, videos, and messages that incite violence and/or promote terrorist activities should not be allowed to be circulated on the Internet, and the Outcome Document must outline measures to counter these developing threats.

The outcome document should also reject the use of ICT for subversive, political, military or criminal purposes.

Consider as a follow up of the Outcome Document the recognition of the need of a global framework to facilitate harmonization and cooperation amongst member states to tackle these threats.

The Outcome Documents must recognize the need for a global framework, to facilitate cooperation among member states to fight cybercrime. The participation of member and observer states of the UN should be included, in the development phases of this framework.

The Outcome Document should also fulfill the mandate echoed in Paragraphs 39, 44, and 45 of the Tunis Agenda, and consider to recommend the adoption of a set of International Norms for Cyber Security under the purview of the UN.

Above all, the Outcome Document should be forward-looking in countering the threats to cyber security to ensure that cyber space does not become the next battleground amongst member states, and remains focused on utilizing ICT's for the benefit of development.

It is important to develop under the auspices of the United Nations a comprehensive and balanced international framework against international cybercrimes. All countries should participate actively in the work of the UN Expert Group on Crime in Cyberspace.

The outcome document should reiterate the importance of cyber ethics in establishing a safe, secure, tolerant and reliable cyber space and strengthening the role of ICT as the enabler of development, as emphasised in paragraph 43 of the Tunis Agenda and mentioned under the Ethical Dimensions of the Information Society of the Geneva Declaration of Principles and Plan of Action.

The central importance of the principles of international law enshrined in the UN Charter, particularly the political independence, territorial integrity and sovereign equality of states, non-interference in internal affairs of other states and respect for human rights and fundamental freedoms should be emphasized.

Financing Mechanism: The G77 and China is concerned over the lack of follow up on funding mechanisms under paragraph 9 of the Tunis Agenda. This review, therefore, should take steps to redress this issue by improving capacity building for ICTs in developing countries and foster increased transfer of technologies to assist developing countries.

The Outcome Document must report on the progress made under Paragraph 23, which called for increased funding for a number of approaches to ICT for development financing that have been given insufficient attention, and specify future goals and responsibilities for the multistakeholder community.

The Outcome Document must report on the progress made under Paragraph 27, which recommended improvements and innovations in existing financing mechanisms, and specify future goals and responsibilities for the multistakeholder community.

The Outcome Document should implement the recommendations under para 24 of the Tunis Agenda, and facilitate further cross-sectoral and cross-institutional coordination on part of both donors and recipients.

The Outcome Document from the Third Financing for Development Conference held in Addis Ababa is particularly relevant to this review. Para 123 of the Addis Outcome Document outlined the establishment of a Technology Facilitation Mechanism, which has a direct link with ICTs and this review process. This mechanism must be integrated into the Outcome Document and utilized, not just to implement the post-2015 development agenda, but also further the vision of using ICTs for development.

The Outcome Document should also fulfill the third bullet in Paragraph 123 of the Addis Outcome Document by undertaking a comprehensive mapping of the information on existing STI initiatives, mechanisms and programmes.

The Outcome Document must also establish a review of the Digital Solidarity Fund, to ensure that all interested stakeholders are working to achieve the focus of using ICTs for development. The review needs to establish an initial fixed corpus from the multi-stakeholder community for its operation, outline mandate for spending the DSF corpus to exclusively focus on bridging digital divide projects also create an annual reporting mechanism wherein the Fund submits reports to the Secretary General, who monitors progress of the Fund and keeps the membership of the UNGA informed regularly

The Outcome Document should also mobilize the multistakeholder community and developed countries to work towards reducing the price of ICTs, and particularly broadband access, by half within the next ten years in developing countries. They should also report on their progress annually to the General Assembly.

Right to Privacy and Freedom of Expression:

We recognize the need for the outcome document to establish a common understanding, based on international law, on issues related to the promotion and protection of the right to privacy in the digital age, including in the context of surveillance programmes given the negative impact that surveillance, including extra-territorial surveillance may have, in particular when carried out on a mass scale.

As such, the Outcome Document must affirm that the same rights that people have off line must also be protected online, including the right to privacy.

The Document must commit member states to pledging that any internet surveillance practices must not be arbitrary or unlawful and should be consistent with their international human rights obligations and in accordance with their obligations under international law, including the principles of sovereignty and territorial integrity.

Net Neutrality

The G77 and China is committed to ensuring that the principles of net neutrality, such as ensuring equal access for all and treating all internet traffic on an equal parity, and that it is protected needs to be recognized in the Review process. The Outcome Document must reiterate importance of net neutrality and outline recommendations for countries to ensure this key tenets (as below) are guarded.

The Outcome Document should also reaffirm the principles of net neutrality:

4. What are general expectations from the WSIS + 10 High Level Meeting of the United Nations General Assembly?

Without prejudice to all other equally important aspects of the Information Society, the WSIS+10 High Level Meeting should provide guidance on the way forward in regard to the Internet governance processes launched by WSIS: the Internet Governance Forum (IGF) and Enhanced Cooperation.

IGF mandate – In respect to the Mandate’s scope and extension, subject to IGF’s structure and composition being reviewed, the Mandate, in keeping with the Tunis Agenda, can be extended for a period of five years. However, this extension must be subject to a review of the IGF to enhance its representativeness and the efficiency and legitimacy of its decisions.

Enhanced Cooperation: The G77 and China is concerned over the lack of progress made on the mandate under paragraph 69 of the Tunis Agenda on Enhanced Cooperation. There has not been any tangible movement on this issue, which would allow governments to, on an equal footing with each other, carry out their roles and responsibilities on international public policy issues relating to the Internet, and would allow developing countries with important ideas to contribute to Internet policy.

The outcome document should consider establishing an intergovernmental forum on enhanced cooperation and its modalities to, as per Paragraph 69 of the Tunis Agenda “enable governments, on an equal footing, to carry out their roles and responsibilities, in international public policy issues pertaining to the Internet, but not in the day-to-day technical and operational matters, that do not impact on international public policy issues.

The G77 and China would submit detailed modalities for the operationalization of this at a later stage.

5. What shape should the outcome document take?

As per Operative Paragraph 4 of the Modalities Resolution 68/302, the outcome document should “take stock of the progress made in the implementation of the outcomes of the World Summit on the Information Society and address potential information and communication technology gaps and areas for continued focus, as well as addressing challenges, including bridging the digital divide, and harnessing information and communication technologies for development”.

The WSIS+10 High Level meeting outcome document should be short and concise in its form. In its substance, it should reaffirm the validity of the WSIS outcome documents, as well as identify priorities towards bridging the digital divide and achieving the other goals that were set in those documents, provide for the extension of the mandate of the IGF and indicate how the discussion on the concept of Enhanced Cooperation should evolve as from 2016.

It should not only take stock of past experience and evaluate the implementation of the WSIS outcomes, but also look ahead and develop a new programme of action that reflects the new circumstances and the goal of building a people-centered, inclusive and development-oriented information society.

While the coordinating and facilitating role of international organizations, such as the International Telecommunication Union, remains essential, coordination with multiple stakeholders should be enhanced at the international level. New missions and fresh impetus should be given to the WSIS process in the context of the post-2015 development agenda.

The outcome document must move beyond simply providing access to ICTs. It must ensure that such access for citizens in developing countries has good quality, is affordable, and is relevant to their needs.

It must set specific targets for the multistakeholder community to significantly increase the relevant and local language content in developing countries, and create mechanisms for these stakeholders to report annually on the progress made on these targets.

It must create a mechanism for the exchange of best practices relating to proper data collection between nations and relevant stakeholders so as to address the difficulties of developing countries in collecting reliable and relevant data related to use of ICTs for development.

It must set criteria for new targets for this review process, which need to be: Time-bound (with review and follow-up procedures outlined in the Outcome Document); Concrete and measureable; Ambitious but achievable based on historical and current trends of progress; Relevant to policy integration; and Based on internationally agreed statistical standards.

The Connect 2020 Agenda targets agreed to at the 2014 Plenipotentiary Conference of the ITU, is also important in this regard. The specific targets of increasing Internet access to 55% of households and 60% of individuals by 2020 should be incorporated in the Outcome Document. Action Line C7 regarding ICT Applications should be updated, so as to reflect new technologies and new issues that have arisen since 2005.