Final Evaluation of the Project:
« Strengthening Public Sector Human Resource Managers Capacities in Africa »

ROA-162-7.

Addis, December 12, 2013
Agenda

- Objectives of the Project
- Main Activities
- Objectives of the Assignment
- Methodology
- Criteria used in Evaluating
- Stakeholders Consulted
- Findings From the Evaluation
- Lessons Learnt
- Recommendations
Objectives of the Project

Main objectives of the Project were:

- to contribute to the strengthening of the institutional capacity of APS-HRMnet, and
- to strengthen individual capacities of HRMs in Africa to design and drive the process of the civil service reforms.
Main Expected Achievements

Objectives were expected to be achieved through:

- capacity building workshops for HRMs in the public sector, which bring together senior HRMs, academicians and top experts in HR to share information and best practices on HRM functions and its strategic role.

- organization of expert group meetings serving as thinking process that generate strong recommendations to improve RHM in African countries.

- Designing and launching on-line training courses serving as continuous learning HRMs even after the completion of the project.
Main Expected Achievements

- Organization of study tours for HRMs to get hands on experience in countries that have exhibited best practices in HRM.
- Designing and maintaining a website for the APS-HRMnet.
- Production of publications on human resource management and development, using materials developed and discussed in workshops and posted them to the APS-HRMnet website.
Objectives of the Assignment

The evaluation was expected to assess the following:

- degree of attainment of the objectives and expected achievements;
- overall impact of the project in strengthening HRMs in Africa in general and the APS-HRMnet in particular;
- effectiveness of the implementation modality;
- results achieved vis-a-vis the available budget (efficiency), from both the qualitative and quantitative perspectives;
- identify the factors of success or failure;
- assess the sustainability of the achieved results, and;
- Draw lessons learnt and advice on how to further strengthen HRMs capacity in Africa’s public sector building upon the achievements of the project.
Methodology

- Document Review
- Group focus discussion
- semi-structured interviews with key stakeholders at different levels
Criteria used in Evaluating the Project

- Relevance
- Efficiency-Value for money
- Effectiveness
- Sustainability
- Coherency-Harmonization
- Impact
## Stakeholders Consulted

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Names</th>
<th>Countries/organ</th>
<th>Positions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Prisca B. MBAGUTA SEZI</td>
<td>Uganda</td>
<td>Minister of State for Public Service</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. George Yambesi</td>
<td>Tanzania</td>
<td>President of the APS-HRMnet</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms. Adah Kabarokole Muwanga</td>
<td>Uganda</td>
<td>Interim Executive Secretary of the APS-HRMnet</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr. John-Mary Kauzya</td>
<td>UNDESA</td>
<td>Chief of Public Administration Capacity Branch Division for Public Administration and Development management Department of Economic and Social Affairs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms. Almaz Atnafu Woldekidane</td>
<td>UNDESA</td>
<td>Senior Governance and Public Administration Officer Division for Public Administration and Development Management Department of Economic and Social Affairs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MUTAHABA Gelase</td>
<td>Tanzania</td>
<td>Chairman AAPAM Tanzania Chapter</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NGUNDA William</td>
<td>Tanzania</td>
<td>Interim Assistant to the Executive Secretary of the APS-HRMnet</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Makhoabane Ledimo</td>
<td>Lesotho</td>
<td>Deputy Principle Secretary, Ministry of Labour and Employment, Lesotho</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AMIDOU ADAMOU</td>
<td>Benin</td>
<td>Director de Cabinet, Ministère de la Réforme Administrative et Institutionnelle</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ahmed El Tayeh Elsamani</td>
<td>Rep. of Sudan</td>
<td>Department General Manager, Ministry of Human Resource Development and Labor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KAYITESI Eugenie</td>
<td>Rwanda</td>
<td>HRM Specialist, National Capacity Building Secretariat, Rwanda</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WACHIRA N. Florence</td>
<td>Kenya</td>
<td>Director Recruitment and Selection, Public Service Commission</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lavelle John</td>
<td>UNDESA</td>
<td>Consultant</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Quantitative performance (Results)

- 6/8 activities were fully completed during the planned period, when 2 others were partial accomplished (additional on-line courses and publication of HR document), and expected to be completed end December 2013.
- Over 1500 HRMs from 46 countries benefited from workshops, study tours, experts group meeting and on-line training.
- 94/123 individual who completed the on-line courses received their certificates.
- Production of publication of HRMD papers presented in workshop and expert group meeting expected to be completed end December 2013
- Another set of on-line courses under development
Findings

Qualitative performance (results)

- According to the evaluation made after workshops and expert group meetings and interviews conducted during this assignment, the workshops and expert group meetings received a very high rating in satisfaction level of participants. They appreciated trainers and all training materials received.
- 76.4% of individuals who completed their on-line courses got their certificates, for which 83% were male and 17% female.
Findings

Relevance

Almost stakeholders consulted recognized that the project was relevant for following reasons:

- it contributed to fill the needs expressed by expert group meeting of April 2007 in Cape Town, the seventh AGF of October 2007 in Ouagadougou and the CAMPS of July 2012 in Addis.

- objectives of the project were very relevant to the human capacity needs identified by different human resource policies and strategies in almost assessed countries (Uganda, Kenya, Tanzania, Sudan, Benin, Rwanda, Lesotho).

- management of human resource identified as a critical issue to the performance of public service of assessed countries.
Findings

Relevance

- Before this project the management of HRs was given low priority in some countries. The managers responsible for human resources were not given the same weight as the line managers running other departments.

Efficiency - Value for Money

- Trainings in workshops were cost effective - the cost per person was reduced compared to courses provided by contractors, exceptionally very limited in terms of attendance.
- It is now possible to offer a wide range of courses and trainings to other staff using trainees who participated to different workshops and expert group meetings.
- Documents provided to participants and on-line training received by HRMs can be also captured as a cost effective achievement provided by the project.
- The Budget execution rate up to date is 97.4%
Findings

Effectiveness

- This criteria is difficult to assess this criteria without clear baselines defined in the project document logic framework. Difficult to determine exactly how effective were HRMs in 2010.
- Therefore, conclusions about the effectiveness are only based on observations and comments given by interviewees.
- Almost interviewed stakeholder recognized that the trainings provided by the project improved much their skills and experience with in turn influenced their day to day working methods.
- The project facilitated the institutional development of the APS-HRMnet which will help to sustain the collaboration and the learning which have been started through this project.
Findings

Sustainability

- The project was designed as a demand-driven one (ideas came from African forums – Cape Town 2007, AGF Ouagadougou 2007, Ghana 2008, Arusha 2009).
- During the implementation, the UNDESA managed funds while Africans managed the businesses and the network.
- Mentors of the APS-HRMnet are African Ministers.
- Some African countries supported project activities by hosting workshops, supporting their launching and local transport of participants (Tanzania, Benin, Ethiopia, Rwanda), and paid participation fees for their officials.
- The Tanzanian government hosted the office of the chairman and offered all facilities during the project's entire duration.
- People working in the Executive Secretariat of the network worked on a volunteer basis.
Findings

Sustainability

- The establishment of the APS-HRMnet as a lead and coordinating forum of HRM capacity development in African Public Service.
- Existence of Government capacity building programs and other development partners supporting CB activities in African countries such as: UNDP, DFID, WB, Commonwealth Secretariat, BTC, CIDA, ECA, IPAC, AAPAM, ACBF, Bilateral, etc.
- All mentioned ensure good ownership and commitments of stakeholders for sustainability of the achievements of this project and initiation of further capacity development interventions of HRMs after the end of the project.
Findings

Coherence

- The intervention was well aligned to the countries’ and partners’ capacity development strategies and priorities.

- Almost stakeholders interviewed agreed that the project was a complementary intervention to what government and other bilateral donors involved in capacity building are doing in the assessed countries.

- Specific CB objectives of national capacity building policies and strategies (HRD and Knowledge based economy-Rwanda, Emphasis put on capacity building of Human Resource Managers in Public Service-Tanzania, Capacity building program for administrative reform-Sudan, New public service management in the context of globalization-Benin, Efficient and effective public service-Kenya, Development of HR for an efficient and effective public service that support the transformation of the countries-Uganda and, Well developed HR to drive the country development-Lesotho).
Findings

Impact

• Very difficult to talk about impact of this project as it is short time and there was no deeper impact assessment towards improvement of HRMS to analyze and formulate HRMD policies and strategies which was an indicator of the project at outcome level.

• But one thing is certain, persons consulted recognized that through training and other CB provided they gained knowledge and skills that enable them to properly perform their functions as HRMs and, through therefore improve the performance of their institutions.

• The advocacy for the elevation of the HR functions and positions began also producing effects (some countries have already reviewed the positioning of HRMs).

• The project was a small contribution we can not expected it to solve all HRMs capacity challenges.
Lessons Learnt

Achievements

- The project has made considerable achievements especially in providing several training courses through workshops for the benefit of HRMs in African Countries.
- Surely the project contributed to the improvement of knowledge, skills and experience of African HRMs and in turn to the improvement of the performance of their respective institutions.
- The APS-HRMnet was established, but it is still very young network which started in 2009, that says the journey has just started and needs a lot of support from all stakeholders to be sustainable.
- The UNDESA support, as a small fund, contributed to the strategic outcome of strengthening the HRMs capacity, but needs are still high and this require joint efforts of partners including concerned States.
Lessons Learnt

Success factors

- Financial and technical Support from UNDESA.
- Support received from African Governments by providing facilities, particularly respective countries where leaders of the Network come from.
- Joint implementation between UNDESA and African Governments.
- Volunteerism of current members of the Executive Board.
- The establishment of the website for on-line training.

Challenges

- African countries are not moving at the same pace in human resource management issues, some are fast other slow.
- Countries have different levels at which they put HRMs. This influence the way things are moving ahead.
- Financial constraints which has made difficult the recruitment of a full time Executive Secretary and having a permanent office.
Lessons Learnt

Challenges

- Capacity of the Network to mobilize more resources for the continuity of the core business.
- Slow growth in membership and cover of all African.
- Communication among members who are allocated in different countries.
Recommendation

To Ministers of Public Service
- To maintain and enhance the political support for uplifting the quality of HRM functions.
- Strategic positioning of Human Resource Managers. Elevation of HRM functions at least at Director Level.
- Ensure quality of public servants especially Human Resource Managers and support their training.

To UNDESA
- Continue supporting financially and technically the APS-HRMnet.
- Facilitate to conduct a deeper assessment of the impact of this first intervention to know the really impact on individual and their institutions and constitute a baseline for further interventions in this area.
Recommendations

To the APS-HRMnet

- Maintaining workshops, advisory services for Public Service in Africa, conduct research in human resource, maintain exchange of experience and good practices between African Public Service.

- Finalize and approve a mid-term strategic plan as guiding strategy for upcoming capacity building activities of the network.

- Increase membership and encourage government to support capacity building programs by hosting workshops and paying for their staff. The support should be also in terms of the readiness of governments to host capacity building workshops and exchange visits.

- Strengthen the Network by having a permanent Executive Secretary and an Office.

- Attract other partners to support the Network particularly in the core business of the Network which is ensuring that HRMs in public service in Africa are well qualified, competent, well positioned and ethical.
Recommendations

Other Development Partners
UNDP, Bilateral, ECA, CIDA, IPAC, Commonwealth Secretariat, ACBF, etc.....

- To use the APS-HRMnet to support reforms in civil service in Africa.